History 690-01

Fall Session: Dr. M. S. Staum
Office No.: Soc. Sciences 606
Office Hours: MWF 2-3
or by appointment

Winter Session: Research Paper advised and graded by interim adviser

The University of Calgary
Fall 2007/Winter 2008
Telephone No.: 220-6424
or 6401 (messages)
E-mail: mstaum@ucalgary.ca

HISTORIOGRAPHY AND THEORIES OF HISTORY

This seminar introduces students to a variety of classical and philosophical efforts to understand history, and asks students to deepen their own reflections about the past by acquaintance with modern or current interpretive techniques and schools of thought.

FALL SESSION:

The first half of this seminar will introduce current debates about “post-modernism” with an emphasis primarily outside the field of Canadian history. After introductory discussions about classic questions of explanation and causation amid changing concepts of philosophy of science, we shall touch upon current debates concerning objectivity and older dilemmas of moral judgment. Then there will be discussion of the aims and techniques of historians in ancient times, the Enlightenment, and in the nineteenth century - respectively, the art of narrative storytelling, the desire to teach lessons, and the aspiration to relate what actually happened. Written docu-dramas in the present will provide a fascinating contrast to the storytelling of the ancients.

The impact of Marxism will highlight the effort to find pattern and meaning in the sequence of past events, along with discussion of the legacy of concepts of “class.” Among mid-twentieth-century historical approaches, there will be a focus on contributions of the French Annales School to modern social and cultural history. Debates about post-modernism will conclude the term. First, there is the question whether historians have access to a reality beyond texts, and the concept of narrative “emplotment” of their texts. Second, we shall look at the power/knowledge concept of Michel Foucault, and touch upon questions of feminist historians on “whose history for what?” Third, there will be a sampling...
of efforts to accommodate marginalized or non-European historical “voices” and to experiment with new techniques of historical expression.

**Evaluation of seminar work will have the following basis:**

1. A term essay of approximately 4000 words (or 16 double-spaced pages) on a subject related to the readings DUE FRIDAY NOVEMBER 30 (absolute deadline Dec. 4 barring illness or emergency) 50%
2. A formal oral report, which may be the basis for the essay 20%
3. Weekly discussion of readings and criticism of reports 30%

Students should discuss the choice of essay topics with the instructor.

**Books to Be Purchased in Bookstore**


**Books on Reserve in the Library Tower Basement Reading Room (2-hour maximum, or in the 3-day stacks when multiple copies exist):**


Journals of Reference: *History and Theory, Critical Inquiry, Clio, Rethinking History, History Workshop Journal*

For excerpts from various schools of thought discussed in the course, see John Tosh, ed. *Historians on History* London: Longman, 2000.

**Week I. September 11. Organizational Meeting and Selection of Report Subjects**


**Week II. September 18. Knowledge and Explanation**

The Post-Modernist Challenge: Beverley Southgate, *Postmodernism and History*, 1-58

The Defense of Knowledge: Keith Windschuttle, *The Killing of History*, 1-38 (Paris Labels) and 203-250

Evans (Reserve) on science and morality, 39-63; on facts and explanation, 65-87; and on causation, 111-137
And for a recent reader, see Keith Jenkins and Alun Munslow, eds. *The Nature of History Reader* London: Routledge, 2004


For a historiographical primer, see Michael Bentley, *Modern Historiography, An Introduction*. London: Routledge, 1999

For the view that history still is like some of the natural sciences, John Lewis Gaddis, *The Landscape of History: How Historians Map the Past* Oxford, 2002.


**Additional literature:**


Arthur C. Danto, "The Decline and Fall of the Analytical Philosophy of History," in Ankersmit and Kellner, 70-76, 84-85

R. F. Atkinson, *Knowledge and Explanation in History*, 1-68, 95-187
Alan Donagan, "The Popper-Hempel Theory Reconsidered," (1964), 127-159 of same volume
Sir Isaiah Berlin, "The Concept of Scientific History," (1960), 5-53 of same volume

**Week III. September 25. Relativism, Objectivity, and Moral Judgment in History**

Novick, 415-521 (and preferably 521-629 on post-modernism)
Appleby et. al. on objectivity, 241-270 or Evans, sources and discourses, 89-110

Thomas Haskell, "Objectivity is not Neutrality: Rhetoric vs. Practice in Peter Novick's That Noble Dream," *History and Theory* 29 (1990), 129-157
Haskell has collected his essays in *Objectivity is not Neutrality: Explanatory Schemes in History*, Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1998.

**Additional literature:**

Allan Megill on "Four Senses of Objectivity" in *Annals of Scholarship* 8(1991) or in *Historical Knowledge, Historical Error*
William Dray (1993), Objectivity and Value Judgment, 34-61
Hans Meyerhoff, *The Philosophy of History in Our Time*, articles by Carl Becker, Charles Beard, and W. H. Walsh on fact and objectivity, pp. 120-152
C. Behan McCullagh, "Can Our Understanding of Old Texts be Objective?" *History and Theory* 30 (1991), 302-323


Atkinson, *Knowledge and Explanation in History*, 69-94, 188-218

Debate on moral judgment by Herbert Butterfield and Isaiah Berlin in Hans Meyerhoff, 228-271

Bercuson and Wise, eds. *The Valour and the Horror Revisited* (CBC documentary questioning Allied and Canadian competence and moral judgment in defense of Hong Kong, strategic bombing of Germany, post-Normandy campaign of ‘44)

As an example of a reluctance to make unambiguous moral judgments, and of a post-modern approach to writing history, see the memoir by Modris Eksteins, *Walking since Daybreak: A Story of Eastern Europe, World War II, and the Heart of our Century* (Toronto: Key Porter, 1999)

See the *History and Theory* (43, Dec. 2004) for articles on morality by Frank Ankersmit, James Cracraft (morality wanted), Antoon DeBaets, Elizabeth Ermarth (postmodernist), Jonathan Gorman (morality wanted), Keith Jenkins (no morality qua historian), Jörn Rüsen (anti-ethnocentric), and Richard Vann (pro-moral judgment)

See also James Sheehan in AHA Perspectives, October, 2005 on moral judgment from the President of the American Historical Association

**Week IV. October 2. The Ancient Greek Historians**

Kelley, *Faces of History*, 1-47 on "mythistory" and "Greek horizons"


Options: Viewing of Bercuson-Herwig films, *Deadly Seas* and *Murder in Normandy*


And Stephen Bann, “Cinema and the Rescue of Historicity,” in the same issue, 124-133

Options: Saint Augustine, *City of God*
Chronicles of Crusades- Joinville and Villehardouin

Renaissance Views: Guicciardini or Machiavelli as Historians

See Kelley, 75-95 on Augustine, 69-128 on medieval historians, 130-161 on Renaissance historians


Peter Gay, 98-125, 368-396 on Enlightenment Views of History
Condorcet on progress on-line- see my Historical Studies 329Theories of Progress at http://www.ucalgary.ca/~mstaum/hist329/index.html

**Week VI. October 16. Speculative Philosophy of History “Metanarratives” and the Rise of the Professional "Objective" Historian**

Debate on “The End of History” and metanarratives today:
Windschuttle, 173-202 (Fall of Communism and End of History)
Iggers and von Moltke selections from Ranke, 25-59
Evans, “The History of History,” 13-37

Options: Comte and the Rise of Positivism
Hegel, Speculative Philosophy of History
Interpretation of Hegel: Peter Singer, *Hegel*
The German Historical school a possible subject (Droysen, Treitschke, etc.)
See also Donald R. Kelley, *Fortunes of History: Historical Inquiry from Herder to Huizinga* New Haven: Yale, 2003 on German, French, British, Italian nineteenth-century historians, 1800 to 1914

**Week VII. October 23. Karl Marx: Historical Materialism as Metanarrative and Critical Tool**

Marx and Engels, *The Communist Manifesto*
Singer, *Marx*
Evans, society and the individual, 139-163

**Additional literature:**
The Debate on Class in *Social History* journal today:
Bryan Palmer critical of discursive theory, 103-114 in Jenkins, *PM Reader*
William Sewell on the bourgeois rhetoric of Sieyès or language of French artisans

**Week VIII. October 30. The Revolt Against History as a Science**

Rickman, *W. Dilthey: Selected Writings*, 88-9, 94 (human studies), 170-76 (understanding), 187 (interdisciplinarity), 203-8 (hermeneutics), 226-31 (empathy); (editor’s introduction good for orientation, 1-31)
Gardiner, 225-241 on Croce and history from the “inside”
Gardiner, 249-262 on Collingwood - reality of idea


David D. Roberts, *Nothing But History: Reconstruction and Extremity After Metaphysics* (on Croce)

For debate on breaking out of the "hermeneutic circle" between a post-structuralist and a historical contextualist:
David Hollinger, "The Return of the Prodigal: The Persistence of Historical Knowing," 610-621
David Harlan, "Reply to David Hollinger," 622-626
Joyce Appleby, "One Good Turn Deserves Another: Moving Beyond the Linguistic; A Response to David Harlan," *American Historical Review* 94 (1989), 1326-1332

Includes leading British, German, French, American historians

**Week IX. November 6. History and the Social Sciences: The Annales Style**


Recommended: Serge Gagnon, *Quebec and its Historians, vol. 2, The Twentieth Century.* 81-163 on works of Fernand Ouellet  
Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie, *The Mind and Method of the Historian*  


For essays on the nature of both social and cultural history, see William Sewell, *Logics of History: Social Theory and Social Transformation* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005)

**Week X. November 13. (to be rescheduled) The Role of Narrative in Historical "Knowledge" and "Truth"**

Keith Jenkins, *On "What is History?: From Carr and Elton to Rorty and White,* chapter 5 on White, 134-179  
Windschuttle on White, 251-278 (History as Literature)

Story-Telling about the Holocaust:  
White in Jenkins, *The Postmodern Reader,* 387-96  
Kellner in Jenkins, 127-138 on “Language and Historical Representation”  
Debate on representing the Holocaust in Jenkins by Kansteiner, Braun, and Lang 413-33

**Additional literature:**

See the discussion on “Historical Fiction, Fictional History, and Historical Reality” introduced by Hayden White in *Rethinking History* 9,3 (June-Sept. 2005): 147-157


See also White’s rejoinder to Georg Iggers in *Rethinking History* (2000).


Hayden White collected essays *The Content of the Form: Narrative Discourse and Historical Representation*, Baltimore, 1987, sequels to White's *Metahistory* (1973) and *Tropics of Discourse* (1978)


*R. McCullagh on narrative


F. R. Ankersmit, "Historical Representation" 205-228

**History and Memory**

Journal *History and Memory*


**Week XI. November 20. Voice and Narrative**
Greg Dening, *Mr. Bligh's Bad Language: Passion, Power, and Theatre on the Bounty*

Windschuttle on Dening and Sahlins, 71-98 (Bad Language), 279-314 (Return of Tribalism)


or Robert F. Berkhofer, "A Point of View on Viewpoints in Historical Practice," in Ankersmit and Kellner, 174-194


Other Literature on Anthropological Approaches to History:
Robert Darnton, *The Great Cat Massacre*, 9-72, 75-104
critique by Harold Mah in Evans
*Journal of Modern History* debate between Roger Chartier and Robert Darnton on symbols 57 (1985), 682-95 and 58 (1986), 218-34


On debate on Australian aboriginal history, see the collected documents by Keith Windschuttle, Stuart MacIntyre, and Robert Manne on the Blackboard site for this course


**Week XII. November 27. The Post-Structuralist Critique of History of Ideas: Foucault and Feminist Uses of Post-Modernism**

TERM ESSAYS DUE NOVEMBER 30, DECEMBER 4 (Final Deadline without penalty)

Windschuttle on Foucault (Discourses of Michel Foucault), 131-172
Evans on knowledge and power, 165-92

Additional literature:

Jan Goldstein, ed. *Foucault and the Writing of History*, and her article, "The Uses of Cousinian Pedagogy in Nineteenth-Century France," 99-115

See forum on application of Foucault's progression from law to discipline-based society in Russia in *American Historical Review* 98,2(1993), 338-381

Options: Feminism


see also Scott, *Only Paradoxes to Offer* and Mona Ozouf debate on French feminism


For Scott’s general view of history, see “After History?” *Common Knowledge* vol. 5 ,no. 3 (1996) reprinted in Keith Jenkins and Alun Munslow, ed. *The Nature of History Reader*, 259-270

Laura Lee Downs, “If ‘woman’ is just an empty category, then why I am afraid to walk alone at night? identity politics meets the postmodern subject” *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 35(1993), 414-51

including reply by Scott and rejoinder by Downs


Kathy Ferguson, "Interpretation and Genealogy in Feminism," *Signs* 16, no. 2(Winter 1991), 322-39


An example of an avant-garde feminist approach by a conventional historian:

Week XIII. December 4 Post-Modernism Debated

Evans, Objectivity and its Limits, 193-220
Joyce Appleby, Lynn Hunt, Margaret Jacob, *Telling the Truth about History*
anti-post-modernist (241-270 already covered under objectivity), but nuanced pragmatism and feminist
Southgate, *Postmodernism and History*, 113-173
Windschuttle, Afterword, 315-332

Perez Zagorin, “Rejoinder to a Postmodernist,” 201-209.

An example of "post-modernism" for a report--David Farber, *Chicago '68*
Chicago, 1988 description of the demonstration and police response outside the Democratic Party National Convention in Chicago, 1968 from 3 perspectives--the Yippie radical fringe group, the organizers of the demonstration, and the police and city administration
Alternatively: Natalie Z. Davis on *Fiction in the Archives: Pardon Tales*

Additional Literature:

Dialogue on Post-Modernism:


Post-Structuralist and Post-Modernist Criticism of Progress, Truth, Meaning:

The Marwick-White Debate

Arthur Marwick, "Two Approaches to Historical Study: The Metaphysical (Including 'Postmodernism') and the Historical" 5-34
Christopher Lloyd, "For Realism and Against Common Sense: A Response to Arthur Marwick," *JCH* 31 (1996), 191-207
Beverley Southgate, "History and Metahistory: Marwick versus White," same issue, 209-214
Wulf Kansteiner, "Searching for an Audience: The Historical Profession in the Media Age-A Comment on Arthur Marwick and Hayden White," same issue 215-219
Geoffrey Roberts, "Narrative History as a Way of Life," same issue, 221-228

* * * * *